

A Look at Aspects of Pedagogical Competence and Transformative Learning Experienced from Pre-service Teachers' Critical Reflection on English Teaching Practicum

M. Zaini Miftah^{ae}, Utami Widiati^{bd*}, Anik Nunuk Wulyani^b, and Tengku Intan Suzila Tengku Sharif^c

^a Universitas Islam Negeri Palangka Raya, Palangka Raya, Indonesia

^b Universitas Negeri Malang, Malang, Indonesia

^c Universiti Teknologi MARA, Pahang, Malaysia

^d Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin, Kuala Terengganu, Malaysia

^e INTI International University, Nilai, Malaysia

*Corresponding author: utami.widiati.fs@um.ac.id

Article information	
Abstract	To comprehend whether pre-service teachers (PSTs) are engaged in reflective practices for pedagogical competence (PC) development within transformative learning (TL), it is essential to scrutinize reflective practices in promoting PC aspects within TL in English teaching practicum programs. This phenomenological case study delved into the aspects of PSTs' PC that showed significant development as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum and the PSTs' TL experiences attributed by critical reflection on the English teaching practicum. Nine Indonesian EFL PSTs purposively selected from their placement schools, and enrolled in a two-month English teaching practicum program participated in this study. Data were obtained from weekly reflective journals and focus group interviews. Thematic analysis was implemented to code the data and identify emergent themes therefrom according to the research aims. The results revealed that the aspects of PSTs' PC that showed significant development as a result of critical reflection fall within the classroom management capability, knowledge of pedagogical approach, and student management capability. Meanwhile, PSTs experienced TL attributed by critical reflection that involved interactive discussion or dialogue, establishing authentic and supportive relationships, and applying personal experiences. The study implies that educators and stakeholders in teacher education programs reevaluate teaching practicum programs, emphasizing PSTs' reflective practices in the light of critical reflection on English teaching practicum for PC developments and TL experience to prepare future teaching professions.
Keywords	critical reflection, EFL pre-service teacher, English teaching practicum, pedagogical competence, transformative learning
APA citation:	Miftah, M. Z., Widiati, U., Wulyani, A. N., & Sharif, T. I. S. T. (2026). A look at aspects of pedagogical competence and transformative learning experienced from pre-service teachers'

critical reflection on English teaching practicum. <i>PASAA</i> , 72, 247–272.
--

1. Introduction

In light of recent developments in teacher education programs, it is becoming extremely difficult to ignore the existence of reflective practice in English teaching practicum to promote pre-service teachers' (PSTs) pedagogical competence (PC) and transformative learning (TL) experience. To date, research shows PSTs may still have a misconception about PC and TL (see Kaspar, 2018; Qin et al., 2022) in their field experiences. EFL PSTs might have little experience in the development of PC within the TL framework in certain teaching practicum. In this regard, PSTs need to be involved in teaching practicum with practical pedagogy within diverse placement schools for their PC development and TL experience (Cho & Johnson, 2020; Qin et al., 2022). To resolve such an urgent issue, English teacher education programs have attempted to serve PSTs with field experience at placement schools in various teaching practicum settings (Wong et al., 2020). Within the English teaching practicum, PSTs would be engaged in a practical teaching atmosphere to reevaluate the teaching experience in the light of critical reflection (Carter & Kurttts, 2019). Indeed, the current English teaching practicum often takes place under specific circumstances and conditions.

Critical reflection during field experiences, such as teaching practicums, has been identified as a key factor in improving PC and TL in EFL/ESL teacher education programs (Qin et al., 2022). On the other hand, teacher education programs play a central role in determining the type of knowledge and PC acquired by PSTs in the TL framework (Nganga, 2020). PSTs should be engaged in such a teaching mode to experience a practical pedagogy in the present school setting, leading them to become competent and transformational teachers (Cho & Johnson, 2020; Qin et al., 2022). For this purpose, reflective practice should be embedded in teacher education programs (Cirocki & Imsa-ard, 2024). Consequently, their challenge is to educate PSTs about the diverse school teaching milieu (Wong et al., 2020), engaging in such current teaching practices. PSTs would present their thoughts on promoting PC and experiencing TL in the light of critical reflection (Carter & Kurttts, 2019) to undergo a current teaching practicum. As such, this highlights the need for further investigation into the issue addressed in the present study.

Empirical research in the EFL context has shown the aspect of engagement in reflective practices to transform PSTs into reflective practitioners and stimulate professional development (Cirocki & Widodo, 2019; Hendriwanto, 2021; Miftah et al., 2022; Widodo & Ferdiansyah, 2018). Research on PSTs' engagement in tech-mediated self-reflection as an innovation tool reconstructed their knowledge, beliefs, and practices within the teaching practicum (Widodo & Ferdiansyah, 2018). PSTs' personal experience was enhanced through video technology as the catalyst to build their personal growth, such as self-confidence and teacher autonomy (Widodo & Ferdiansyah, 2018). Meanwhile, research on ELT reflective practices contributed to operationalizing the ideas of reflective practice (Cirocki & Imsa-ard, 2024; Girocki & Widodo, 2019) and to contributing to PC development and fostering TL in the post-pandemic time (Miftah et al., 2025). It implied the PSTs' engagement in critical reflection to deepen their knowledge of teaching practices and transform them into reflective practitioners. Furthermore, Hendriwanto's (2021) research on reflective practice engaged PSTs in professional tasks such as self-reflection in an English teaching practicum to develop critical

reflection. Stimulating PSTs' professional development, such as their identities dealing with language and pedagogy through reflection, influenced the meaning-making of their professional selves to be reflective practitioners as PSTs' identity (Ardi et al., 2023; Hendriwanto, 2021). Akin to these studies, research was carried out in a multicultural context experienced by PSTs during an international teaching practicum (Auliya et al., 2020; Kabilan et al., 2020). PSTs' reflective practice raised their awareness of diverse cultures, contributing to teaching strategy enactment. The enacted teaching strategies met students' necessities and characteristics to facilitate PSTs' reflective competence in professional development (Auliya et al., 2020; Kabilan et al., 2020).

Similar research centered on the aspect of PSTs' self-concept reflected in their teaching performance (Rachmawati, 2022). PC and professional competence as the PSTs' academic aspects of self-concept affected self-perception of their self-concept; teaching practicum was influenced by more academic challenges than non-academic aspects, such as emotional and social competence for PSTs (Rachmawati, 2022). In addition, Sari et al.'s (2022) study addressed the PSTs' challenges encountered in teaching practicum in diverse geographical spaces, providing chances for TL. The research only focuses on the challenges affecting PSTs' negative emotions in TL rather than positive emotions during teaching practicum (Sari et al., 2022). Furthermore, research on self-efficacy in teaching during teaching practicum revealed that PSTs' teaching efficacy varied according to their teaching tasks. PSTs are challenged in classroom management for their PC development (Tutyandari, 2023).

To date, research regarding the aspects of PC and TL experienced from PSTs' critical reflection on English teaching practicum in transforming into reflective educators has not been identified. As shown earlier in diverse teaching practicums, the previous research indicated the aspects of PSTs' engagement and personal experience in tech-mediated self-reflection (Widodo & Ferdiansyah, 2018). The study shows a lack of exploration of how critical reflection enables PSTs to hone their PC, along with other aspects such as TL. Research fell within PSTs' engagement and operationalizing ideas in reflective practice in enhancing PC and TL (Cirocki & Widodo, 2019; Miftah et al., 2024, 2025). The studies indicate a lack of engagement of PSTs with different levels of reflection on the teaching-learning process from diverse angles to experience TL. Another research focused on stimulating professional development identity to be reflective practitioners (Ardi et al., 2023; Hendriwanto, 2021). The studies lack exploring PSTs' structured reflective practice with a type of critical reflection in teaching practicum that influences their PC development to build an identity to be transformational teachers. In a multicultural context during an international teaching practicum, PSTs' reflective practice raised awareness of multicultural experience for the enacted teaching strategies (Auliya et al., 2020; Kabilan et al., 2020). The studies are lacking in exploring critical reflection practices for PSTs' PC development in carrying out teaching practicum in multicultural contexts within TL. PSTs showed more challenges in developing their non-academic elements, such as personal and social competencies with self-concept reflection, academic challenges, and teaching efficacy for professional growth (Rachmawati, 2022; Tutyandari, 2023). The studies inadequately explored the development of PSTs' PC within the TL framework for future teaching professions as transformational teachers. In addition, research on reflection on teaching practicum showed PSTs' teaching challenges and TL opportunities during teaching practice, which affected them in experiencing negative emotions in TL (Sari et al., 2022). The

study lacks searching for the challenges PSTs face during teaching practice, such as PC development, as well as their challenges and TL experience.

The existing studies have not treated the aspects of PC and TL experienced from PSTs' critical reflection on the English teaching practicum. Therefore, the limited research calls forth more research scrutinizing the aspects of PSTs' PC, which showed significant development and PSTs' TL experience as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum. Providing PSTs with opportunities to face challenges in developing academic aspects such as PC and TL during the English teaching practicum is essential for stimulating their professional development (Farrell, 2009, 2019; Mezirow, 1997). Hence, this case study seeks to explore the aspects of PSTs' PC, which indicated significant development as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum and the PSTs' TL experience in the light of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum in the Indonesian EFL context. This study formulates the following research questions:

RQ1: Which aspects of PSTs' PC show significant development as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum?

RQ2: How do PSTs experience TL in the light of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum?

2. Literature Review

2.1 Role of Critical Reflection within English Teaching Practicum

The terms reflection and critical reflection are often used interchangeably, although the meanings may differ (Farrell, 2009, 2019). However, it is known that not all reflections are critical reflections (see Black, 2021; Wyant & Lockwood, 2018). Critical reflection is considered a type of reflection requiring more in-depth reflection activities during the English teaching practicum within TL (Black, 2021). It tends to be of a higher thinking level (Wyant & Lockwood, 2018). In its practice, identifying critical reflection requires the reflection descriptors of assessing reflections from PSTs' writings of the reflective journals (Harland & Wondra, 2011). Apart from differences in understanding reflection, numerous researchers concur that there is no one right way to reflect (e.g., Arslan, 2019; Black, 2021). Therefore, the current study brings PSTs to comprehend and practice critical reflection on English teaching practicum for PC development within the TL framework (Farrell, 2009; Kaspar, 2018; Qin et al., 2022) in the field experience.

Empirical research has suggested the necessity for PSTs to reflect on English teaching practicum by observing, analyzing, and evaluating teaching experiences through critical reflection (Black, 2021; Dikilitas & Comoglu, 2022). Critical reflection has contributed to PSTs being critical, developing cognitively and personally meaningful knowledge (Gibbons & Farley, 2021), enhancing PC, and shaping their TL (Miftah et al., 2025). In critical reflection practice, PSTs could tell their classroom experiences from direct observation and teaching by comparing and reframing past experiences for the next instructions (Cho & Johnson, 2020; Dikilitas & Comoglu, 2022). PSTs reflected on the teaching practicum and developed their PC and TL for a better learning process (Dikilitas & Comoglu, 2022; Nganga, 2020). During the English teaching practicum, PSTs could reflect in real-time and on previous class experiences through the reflection document or reflective journals (Zhu et al., 2020). Moreover, PSTs' critical reflection is considered a reflective practice to form a new conceptual framework for a successful teaching practicum (Cho & Johnson, 2020). The process of critical reflection exists

only to show evidence of changes in conceptual frameworks (Nganga, 2020). Hence, critical reflection plays a more crucial role in PSTs' PC development within TL (Suciu & Mata, 2011), particularly in the Indonesian EFL context (Widiati & Hayati, 2015). Therefore, the present study delves into the aspects of PSTs' PC that showed significant development as a result of critical reflection and how PSTs experience TL in the light of critical reflection within the English teaching practicum.

2.2 Developing Pedagogical Competence (PC) through Critical Reflection

Developing PSTs' PC becomes urgent within teacher education programs (Nganga, 2020). PC plays a very influential role in successful learning through the instructional process (Shah et al., 2020). PC is related to how teachers undergo an instructional process to assist learners in attaining learning objectives (Suciu & Mata, 2011). PC also becomes a distinctive competence distinguishing PSTs from other professions (Shah et al., 2020). In teaching practicum, the development of PC components should be naturally built based on the theoretical framework. In this regard, Madhavaram and Laverie's (2010) PC framework is applicable. PSTs should develop five elements of PC: content knowledge, knowledge of pedagogical approaches, and capabilities of the course, classroom, and student management (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010). To be professional teachers, PSTs are recommended to possess and increase each aspect of PC (Perumal & Maistry, 2021) to boost the quality of foreign language teaching (Suciu & Mata, 2011). In fostering PC, critical reflection plays a vital role. PSTs build up their personal knowledge and capabilities through critical reflection (Perumal & Maistry, 2021). Critical reflection becomes a powerful tool to foster PC. PSTs can evaluate their learning process through critical reflection on the teaching practicum for a comprehensive view of their PC development (Shah et al., 2020). PSTs require practices of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum (Arslan, 2019) to stimulate PC. However, if PSTs have no chances for critical reflection as reflective practices, they might encounter pedagogical issues pertaining to PC aspects development as the potential challenges (Konig et al., 2020). For the nexus of PC development to TL and future teaching, PSTs are required to build PC as their personal behaviors and abilities (Suciu & Mata, 2011) within TL for changes in their educations (Mezirow & Taylor, 2009) for future careers as transformational teachers (Cho & Johnson, 2020). Hence, following Madhavaram and Laverie's (2010) PC framework, the current study explores the aspects of PSTs' PC that showed significant development as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum (Arslan, 2019; Supkhonovna, 2021).

The development of PC aspects becomes vital to investigate due to the requirement for foreign language teachers to have standard teacher competencies (Widiati & Hayati, 2015). In teaching practices, promoting PC becomes crucial as PC deals with the pedagogical way to undergo the teaching and learning process to assist students in reaching instructional goals (Suciu & Mata, 2011). Empirical research has indicated that PSTs experience more challenges in developing PC as part of academic aspects than non-academic aspects, such as personal and social competencies (Rachmawati, 2022; Zhu et al., 2020). As such, the current study investigates evolving PC aspects within the TL framework for PSTs' future teaching careers as transformational, competent, and professional teachers.

2.3 Experiencing Transformative Learning (TL) Grasped from Critical Reflection

In today's teacher education programs, the goal of fostering PSTs' TL in the light of critical reflection on English teaching practicum is to develop their engagement in critical reflection to rethink and reevaluate experiences (Mezirow & Taylor, 2009). On urgent TL in the teaching practicum, Mezirow (1991) develops TL, which is oriented to constructivism. In the TL process, PSTs experience a critical condition of change to reevaluate their beliefs and prior experiences. TL theory focuses on making meaning in learning (Mezirow, 1991). Consequently, it has positive implications for PSTs in teaching practicum by carrying out problem-solving projects that are oriented to the future teaching profession (Archer-Kuhn et al., 2021; Dewey, 1933) and reflecting on the teaching practicum (Arslan, 2019). As such, in fostering TL, PSTs might have experiences in terms of individual experience, critical reflection, discussion or dialogue, holistic orientation, context awareness, and authentic and supportive relationships (Cranton & Taylor, 2012; Mezirow & Taylor, 2009).

Empirical studies showed the benefits of TL during English teaching practicum via the transformative process (Kostara et al., 2022; Mezirow, 1997) such as analyzing experiences through reflections and dialogue, implementing critical reflection in classrooms, making dialogue engaging students' assessment of their belief, feeling and value in English learning (Cranton & Taylor, 2012; Mezirow & Taylor, 2009), reflecting on problem-solving (Senyshyn, 2018), building teachers' professionalism (Ardi et al., 2023; Nolan & Molla, 2021), fostering intercultural learning (Senyshyn, 2018), and boosting higher order thinking skills (Wyant & Lockwood, 2018). PSTs engaged in learning through TL for work empowerment. However, the field experience, such as the English teaching practicum in the placement schools, explores new pedagogy implications in the TL framework (Archer-Kuhn et al., 2021; Dewey, 1933), particularly in fostering PSTs' TL as the focus for direct learning practices must be meaningful (Kostara et al., 2022; Mezirow, 1991). Therefore, PSTs' experience in fostering TL in the light of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum is further explored in the current study.

In short, an examination of the literature on the current study issue indicates that critical reflection on English teaching practicum as a learning support can boost PSTs to critically reevaluate arising problems during the teaching practicum, since critical reflection is believed to be essential for PSTs' PC development within the TL framework for the current study of teacher education. Critical reflection should be practiced in a sustainable teaching practicum program in which they directly enhance PC. In more practices, PSTs can form a new conceptual framework for teaching practice through more in-depth reflection. Throughout the teaching practicum, PSTs are empowered to critically reflect on their teaching experience to reevaluate their teaching performance in the teaching practicum and develop their PC within the TL framework. Furthermore, TL occurs when PSTs experience problems in certain situations, leading them to ask about the frame of reference and reevaluate their beliefs and past experiences for fundamental changes in teaching practices. This is to explore new pedagogy implications in the TL framework. In this respect, the literature suggests that critical reflection on teaching practicum is strongly encouraged within the TL framework in which PSTs' PC can be developed in the light of critical reflection.

3. Methodology

3.1 Design

The study aimed to look at the aspects of pedagogical competence (PC) of pre-service teachers (PSTs), showing significant development as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum and how PSTs experience transformative learning (TL) in the light of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum. Hence, a phenomenological case study research design bounded by the reflective practice that the participants had experienced throughout the English teaching practicum was employed (Merriam, 2009; Yin, 2018). This design sought to elucidate personal human activities without making generalizations about the phenomenon (Yin, 2018). Within this embedded case study, this phenomenological approach involves several research participants to bring in a single better finding about a phenomenon to grasp how individuals experience the phenomenon (Merriam, 2009). Thus, this case study design was employed to facilitate the grasp of the aspects of EFL PSTs' PC showed significant development as a result of critical reflection and their reflective practice experiences in developing their PC within TL in the light of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum, with a complete picture of their experiences.

3.2 Participants

This study involved nine pre-service English teachers as the research participants who enrolled throughout a two-month English teaching practicum program held by the English Teacher Education Program at a university in Palangka Raya, Indonesia. The participants were labelled PST (pre-service teacher): PST-1 to PST-9. The participant recruitment was carried out using a purposive sampling technique (Merriam, 2009) with the selection of the participants from the groups of PSTs at the placement schools with specific criteria: volunteering to be participants, becoming PSTs at the diverse secondary school levels, positioned in distinct placement schools with diverse school characteristics and grades, and recognized as reflective PSTs based on the English teaching practicum supervisors' approval. The supervisors recruited them through selection from the groups of PSTs who have field experiences of reflective practices and the knowledge to deliver information dealing with critical reflection on the teaching practicum. Following the ethical protocol (Hammersley & Traianou, 2012), before the commencement of the study, the selected participants signed the consent forms to contribute to the research study. The participants were guaranteed confidentiality and specified pseudonyms. Table 1 shows the participants' profiles in detail.

Table 1

Profiles of the Participants

PSTs	Personal profiles		Placement school context	
	Sex (M=Male; F=Female)	Age (years old)	School level (Secondary school)	Grade; Class size (average)
PST-1	M	21	Private senior high school	Tenth; 10
PST-2	M	22	State senior high school	Tenth; 20
PST-3	F	21	Private Islamic senior high school	Tenth; 30

PST-4	F	21	Private vocational high school	Eleventh; 14
PST-5	F	22	Private Islamic vocational high school	Eleventh; 30
PST-6	F	21	State Islamic senior high school	Tenth; 37
PST-7	M	21	State junior high school	Ninth; 32
PST-8	F	22	Private Islamic junior high school	Ninth; 25
PST-9	F	22	State Islamic junior high school	Seventh; 31

3.3 Data Collection

Weekly reflective journal (Wong et al., 1995) yielded PSTs' reflective journal writing towards critical reflections. We assigned them to write eight reflective journals for eight weeks of a two-month English teaching practicum. Prior to writing journals, a modelling session was conducted utilizing a weekly reflection sheet with reflective questions as the guideline for criticality and to lead them to the same forms of journals. Then, PSTs submitted reflective journals to the first researcher's WhatsApp account after weekly writing. After submission, we evaluated and identified their critical reflections using a reflection descriptor (Harland & Wondra, 2011). After PSTs' critical reflections were identified completely, focus group interviews were conducted with them.

Focus group interviews (Seidman, 2006) were carried out to validate the data obtained from reflective journals. Semi-structured interviews (DeJonckheere & Vaughn, 2019) were conducted. Three simultaneous focus group interview sessions were conducted, covering three people in each session, with approximately 30 minutes for each. Two groups had face-to-face meetings at the university campus, while another group was conducted synchronously through a Zoom meeting.

The interview materials were sent to participants before the D-day via WhatsApp to ensure they were well-prepared. The interviews used the Indonesian language to make the questions understandable. Follow-up questions were used to attain in-depth information and for clarification (Merriam, 2009). All the participants were asked seven basic questions: (1) 'What aspects of your PC increased after reflecting on the English teaching practicum?' (2) 'Why have the aspects of your PC increased?' (3) 'How do you develop PC aspects through reflections on English teaching practicum?' (4) 'What aspects of your PC have significantly developed?' (5) 'Do you experience TL through reflections on the English teaching practicum? In what cases?' (6) 'How do you experience TL through reflections on English teaching practicum?' and (7) 'What lessons have you learned from TL experience?' To finish, the interview results were recorded and transcribed verbatim for further analysis.

3.4 Data Analysis

The data from the written reflection and interview were analyzed deductively (Seidman, 2006). Thinking deductively in this study under the rationale that the approach allows researchers to triangulate collected qualitative data with existing theories. It also allows researchers to analyze data with greater focus and direction since they have a specific theory

to examine or triangulate for the increase of research validity and reliability. Hence, a deductive approach in a case study can be a good choice if researchers have a specific theory (Fereday & Muir-Cochrane, 2006; Seidman, 2006). The thematic analysis (Boyatzis, 1998) discovered distinguished themes pertaining to the research purpose. We analyzed the literature-based prior famous themes to unpack the aspects of PSTs' PC that showed significant development as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum and the PSTs' TL experiences in the light of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum. We warranted that each line of the written reflection and the transcription was analyzed and thematized accordingly. We employed an open coding (Saldana, 2021) to confirm that other themes emerged from the data after the data saturation was achieved.

The written reflections were coded line-by-line (Saldana, 2021). The recurring themes of reflective writings were identified and analyzed. We determined themes under the coding results with parameters and identified a considerable theme regarding the research focus. Then, we transcribed the interview data and translated them into English (Widodo, 2014), and they were coded line-by-line (Saldana, 2021). The recurring themes over individual interviews were identified and analyzed. We determined themes under the coding results with the parameters and identified considerable themes relevant to the research emphasis. The emergent themes identified from thematic analysis (Boyatzis, 1998) of the written reflection and interview data were discussed based on each of the research aims for data interpretation (Silverman, 2015). To end, we drew a conclusion for the result presentation. An example of the coding process is exposed in Table 2.

Table 2

The Example of Coding Process

Written data/interview transcription in English equivalent	Parameters	Codes	Themes
<i>After reflecting on my teaching, I have made significant developments in managing my classroom. I employed teaching methods while managing the class. Now, I have valuable experience in teaching practicum. It helps me to prepare for better teaching.</i>	Managing the classroom, Ability to manage classrooms, Developing classroom management	Managing classrooms	Classroom management capability
<i>I established dialogue interactively in the class to overcome emergent issues. I facilitated discussion sessions freely. Delivering materials and resolving crucial issues became a trend within the discussion. In this process, students exchanged ideas with others.</i>	Interactive dialogue, Interactive discussion, Problem-solving, Class discussion	Discussing the arising issues interactively	Interactive discussion or dialogue

To increase the trustworthiness of the data analysis, we undertook member checking and peer debriefing techniques. These methods reviewed the interpretation of the research findings and ensured greater credibility (Janesick, 2015). Member checking verifies the accuracy of the obtained data (Merriam, 2009). We sent the data analysis results to all the participants via their WhatsApp accounts, letting them validate the research findings, correct any inaccuracies, and provide extended data. In the meantime, peer debriefing strengthens the plausibility of the interpretation of the research findings (Janesick, 2015). We consulted a professor and shared a draft of the research findings with her, enquiring for feedback and assessment. This process assisted researchers in removing any biases or emotional influences that might interfere with objective decision-making and analysis (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

4. Results

4.1 Aspects of Pedagogical Competence (PC) that Developed Significantly through Critical Reflection

The analysis results reveal that the aspects of EFL PSTs' PC that showed significant development as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum are revealed through these emergent themes, such as *classroom management capability*, *knowledge of pedagogical approach*, and *student management capability*. The themes are categorized under PC since they are related to the PSTs' ability to manage the learning process and create an effective and conducive learning environment (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010; Shah et al., 2020). For a clear picture, the themes are presented as follows.

Classroom Management Capability

The participants voiced that the aspect of PC was mainly worked up within their capabilities in managing the classrooms during the English teaching practicum. Classroom management capability seems to be the PSTs' ability to design, adapt, and manage various learning activities simultaneously for the class to facilitate maximum learning for students (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010). PSTs initially were never skilled in classroom management practice. During the teaching practicum, their hands-on experiences greatly enhanced their PC. They got motivated to manage the classroom based on their perceptions. PSTs managed classes based on their reflection on the students' less attention to the class activities. To address the class issue, they organized the class and assisted the students with various individual capabilities to get connected with the teacher during class activities. PST-2 and PST-8, for example, expressed:

At first, I had difficulties managing my classes as most students did not pay much attention to me. So, after my reflection, I get motivated to improve how I manage the class by understanding individual concerns. I was able to manage the class little by little, and my students paid attention to my teaching. Their feedback led to my improved classroom management. That is how I felt. (PST-2, Focus Group Interview)

My teaching experience in the third meeting changed how I managed the class to create a pleasant atmosphere. At first, my teaching was not interesting, and my students felt bored with my class activities. I knew that I had less ability to organize the class. To resolve it, I was motivated to improve my ability to manage the class more efficiently and effectively. I also needed help dealing

with teaching methods. So, I looked for ways, such as using effective technology media and communicating with students, to handle the class. I invited them to do ice-breaking by singing, playing, or doing yells together. I always asked them about their understanding, and I allowed them to ask questions without hesitation. From their feedback, I made it with improvement, but it gradually got better. (PST-8, Reflective Journal)

The above excerpts indicate that PSTs focused on developing classroom management capability. PSTs were encouraged to organize the class during the English teaching practicum. PSTs' critical reflection influenced their motivation to manage the class, especially in response to students' inattentiveness or disruptions in the classroom environment. Student feedback prompted gradual improvements in their classroom management skills. The element of criticality indicated more changes in teacher roles. The changes in their roles of managing classrooms improved after reflecting on their teaching experience. PSTs were motivated to develop their capabilities to organize the class for the better. From their critical reflection, PSTs previously found it with less motivation for classroom management. Consequently, it was essential to address the issue by organizing the class well. They solved the issue by effectively utilizing technology in the class and interacting effectively with the students. The class gradually improved to become more effective and efficient.

Knowledge of Pedagogical Approach

The participants also expressed that the aspect of PC within their knowledge of pedagogical approaches was significantly enhanced after making critical reflections on the English teaching practicum. They made instructional design and applied teaching methods, along with managing the classroom matters within the teaching practicum. They were aware of grasping the pedagogy in English teaching, as seen from their student feedback. They learned much from their prior experience with the inadequacies of the enactment of teaching strategies in the class. In developing their pedagogical approaches, they practiced enacting specific learning techniques, strategies, and methods during the class. PST-4 and PST-7, for instance, illustrated:

I managed the class through specific learning strategies such as discussion and dialogue. My teaching ability significantly increased when I asked for their opinions and engaged in dialogue. In small groups, my students tried to comprehend the discussion materials. They did not comprehend the subject matter yet. They were less aware and paid less attention to the materials. So, in the discussion and dialogue, I asked them to review the materials. I did not blame them if there were mistakes. I repeated the presentation of the materials and asked them to pay more attention to the lesson. These are my challenges. (PST-4, Focus Group Interview)

The teaching practicum experience had an impact on changing ways to reevaluate my teaching. Previously, my students were reluctant to engage in the class activities. To solve this issue, I applied a teaching strategy, making the teaching more student-centered. I asked students to learn an issue by imitating my teaching model. They tried to use their knowledge and abilities throughout learning activities. They worked on tasks with peers and presented

their work using PPT. In that way, I demonstrated innovative teaching methods for a more fun class, and students were motivated to learn and changed their mindset in learning. They felt more enthusiastic and engaged in learning during the activities. (PST-7, Reflective Journal)

As mentioned above, PSTs practiced teaching methods better than those in the prior classrooms. Their knowledge of pedagogical approaches got a boost attributed by critical reflection on the English teaching practicum. While they practiced pedagogical methods, PSTs implemented classroom management strategies, particularly in responding to student disengagement and learning challenges. In this regard, their pedagogical decisions and classroom management strategies were mutually essential during their English teaching practicum. They had more experience in developing instructional design and implementing teaching methods. To develop pedagogical methods accompanied by classroom management strategies, PSTs practiced enacting specific and relevant teaching strategies such as discussion and dialogue. In small groups, PSTs transformed their students' learning to argue and comprehend the issue materials. Thus, from the discussion and dialogue, they asked students to review the material and discuss the arising issue. Shifted from the earlier teachings, PSTs reevaluated and changed teaching methods to be more applicable in classrooms. Their teaching was also facilitated with media support from Internet resources. PSTs encouraged students to bring their practical knowledge and abilities into the class and to engage their knowledge and practical experience in class activities.

Student Management Capability

The participants shared that critical reflection on the English teaching practicum has inputs for significantly increasing their capability to manage students. Student management capability tends to be the PSTs' ability to manage students by assessing their achievements and reactions, and then motivating, advising, counseling, and mentoring them accordingly (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010). PSTs had experience in managing students while managing classrooms throughout the English teaching practicum. They made comprehensible interactions to recognize students' characteristics, leading to active engagement in learning during the class. Students' diverse attitudes influenced their learning as they had different learning styles. They reached effective and efficient teaching and meaningful learning as well by making a thorough increase in the capability to manage the students. As PST-2 and PST-6 acknowledged:

My teaching experience has completely changed how I manage the students. I committed to better teaching practices to assist students in learning. In the previous meeting, they were unmotivated to learn and work on the task. They were a little enthusiastic during the class. I was motivated to manage the students to run well. The class became more efficient, effective, and meaningful. I provided them with more mentoring and approach during the class. I also reviewed their inappropriate attitudes toward learning for their attitude change. From my perspective, they got motivated to learn, as indicated by their learning engagement during classes. (PST-2, Reflective Journal)

Previously, my students had little chance to interact with each other when they were learning in class. I tried to handle them better in learning activities. This condition encouraged me to be well-prepared to organize the class and students to be conducive. I managed the class through appropriate teaching methods and also conveyed materials properly. I could deal with various student behaviors, which were initially very challenging. This situation developed my pedagogical competence to manage the class. (PST-6, Focus Group Interview)

The excerpts above revealed that PSTs' capability of student management increased as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum. PSTs were motivated to manage students to run the class more efficiently, effectively, and meaningfully. By mentoring and approaching students more intensively, students could change their behaviors for more active learning. PSTs approached students to identify their characteristics comprehensively. They handled students more efficiently during the class by recognizing students' diverse behaviors. Their experiences of how to be familiar with the students' attitudes in the classroom could motivate and assist students in learning English. PSTs ensure that their students respond to the teaching instructions due to the understandable communication during learning activities. PSTs apply effective student management to lead to desirable student behaviors such as adequate learning preparation, full and active learning participation, and maintaining class attendance. It also reduces the perceived student-teacher distance and helps students become more intrinsically motivated (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010).

4.2 The EFL PSTs' Transformative Learning (TL) Experience in the Light of Critical Reflection

The PSTs' TL experience in the light of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum is discovered within the emergent themes from the data analysis. These emergent themes, such as *interactive discussion or dialogue*, *establishing authentic and supportive relationships*, and *applying personal experience*, are considered part of TL since they are related to the learning process, facilitating big changes in an individual's perspective, understanding, and behavior (Cranton & Taylor, 2012; Mezirow & Taylor, 2009). These emergent themes are discussed in the following subsections.

Interactive Discussion or Dialogue

The participants experienced TL within interactive discussion or dialogue throughout the teaching practicum. The interactive discussion or dialogue on the arising issues impacted learning activities significantly. Practically, they opened the class discussion to facilitate students with interactive dialogue to share ideas and think critically. The idea exchanges with each other happened in the process of interactive discussion. For example, PST-9 and PST-7 illustrated:

My teaching experience changed how I make innovations in teaching to assist students faster in absorbing lessons. In the previous meetings, my students got unmotivated and were not very interested in my class. I feel my class activities were too monotonous and boring. A few students felt that learning

English was problematic, even though they attended the class. So, I tried to find ways to reduce students' fear of learning English. I tried to build innovative teaching strategies. I handled the students for class discussions. This experience assisted me in encouraging my teaching practicum to enhance my teaching skills. Having interactive discussions provides students with chances to practice critical thinking skills. The dialogue session engages students in the classroom, running well. Consequently, better learning changes are visible in the teaching practicum. (PST-9, Reflective Journal)

From my reflection, I could establish dialogue interactively with students during the teaching practicum week by week. At first, my students were reluctant to share ideas before the class. They seem to be passive during the class. It might be a result of my lack of teaching methods. I then think it over, and finally, I have a thought to open dialogues with the class. I provide students with the freedom to discuss with each other in class. I hold dialogues with students to discuss the lessons. They can exchange ideas with peers. If they have a problem comprehending the materials, they can ask me. I am pleased to assist and discuss the problems to solve. (PST-7, Focus Group Interview)

The above excerpts confirmed that PSTs fully held interactive discussions or dialogue to let students engage in a free discussion on the arising issue during teaching practicum. This activity provides students with a free talk in an idea exchange with others. The interactive dialogue was enacted during the class activities and became an effective way to overcome issues. This process drives students to develop critical thinking skills for TL practices effectively. In this regard, the criticality lies in more changes in critical thinking for better teaching practices. PSTs' critical reflection promotes critical thinking when enacting discussion or dialogue interactively.

Establishing Authentic and Supportive Relationships

The participants acknowledged that they built up positive interactions with students during the teaching practicum. In this respect, they have experienced TL that lies within establishing authentic and supportive relationships. They established active communication with students. The positive interactions affected the support of learning activities. The students felt more comfortable with PSTs' presence in the class, so the current learning condition made it easier to comprehend the materials. PST-1 and PST-5 shared:

At first, I found that my students were unmotivated to learn. I knew that each student had their process. Some quickly absorbed lessons, and others were slower. My emotions were not controlled well in classes to keep engaging students. I then tried to be open-minded to make mutual relationships with students to create the relationship authentically and sportively. I appreciate their achievement in understanding the materials during class activities. In this case, I established communication with every student both inside and outside the classroom. Establishing supportive relationships made the

teaching process more enjoyable. The class became more comfortable with the mutual interaction. This atmosphere unconsciously made them more easily comprehend the materials. (PST-1, Focus Group Interview)

My transformative learning experience has improved. In previous meetings, the learning process in my class ran poorly since my class had inefficient learning activities and an uncomfortable class atmosphere. I realize that my students have different characteristics and personalities, affecting the way they learn. I then tried to build emotional relationships with them in class. I felt this ability after going through the teaching process in several meetings. I established an emotional relationship with them in several ways, such as asking about their feelings, making a joke, telling a little about my daily life, and asking about their daily life. I tried to be their friend and teacher as well. The class became comfortable, and they engaged in learning. The learning process ran well and efficiently when a sense of comfort was created between us. (PST-5, Reflective Journal)

In the above excerpts, PSTs' TL knowledge falls in their established, authentic, and supportive relationships with the students. They established active interaction with students inside and outside the classroom. The interactive communication affected the support of learning activities throughout the English teaching practicum. In this matter, the PSTs' TL experience built up their emotional relationship and benefited the students with diverse characteristics and personalities in learning to grasp new knowledge during the class. This process also affected PSTs in fostering their TL during the teaching practicum.

Applying Personal Experience

The participants also possess TL knowledge in applying their personal experiences. They identified the class issues and uncovered the issues by applying their past personal problematic experience; the so-called application of personal experience. They transformed students' insight into learning English from arduous issues to effortless ones. Their personal experience was also applied in the class discussion during the English teaching practicum. For example, PST-3 and PST-5 expressed:

After reflecting on my English teaching practicum, I evaluated my teaching to comprehend the students and took into account what appropriate actions were. Previously, my students were passive in participating in learning during the class. I tried to transform students' perspectives towards learning English so that it was not as intricate as they thought. I transformed them to engage in class discussions. I started a question with the students to assist them in participating in learning better. I also talked with them about how to solve the rising class issues. I used my individual experience to change their mindsets. I built good communication with students for sharing ideas. My individual experience from classroom learning motivated me to foster my transformative learning. (PST-3, Reflective Journal)

I have experience with transformative learning practices in implementing individual experiences. In an earlier meeting, I realized that the teaching materials were less valuable, and it was very challenging. My individual experience was useful in delivering materials on topics referring to past experiences. In practice, I asked students to imitate a model by relating the materials to their personal experiences. Directing students using individual experience contributed to the process of changing students' perspectives on learning for the better. I facilitated them to change their minds by provoking them with new insights in the learning materials. The individual experience indirectly assisted in explaining materials to be more effective. (PST-5, Focus Group Interview)

The excerpts above inform that PSTs' TL knowledge is illuminated by their personal experiences. PSTs shared their personal experience to unfold students' thoughts on overcoming the emergent issues during the teaching practicum. They also practiced solving the class issues using their personal experience in the class discussion to transform students' mindsets toward learning English to be better. They built communication with students to make good relationships by sharing ideas. Thus, the personal experience they showcased and applied before the class was the trajectory to drive students toward superb learning motivation.

5. Discussion

5.1 Significant Development of Pedagogical Competence (PC) Aspects as a Result of Critical Reflection

The study results demonstrated that PSTs' capability in managing classrooms developed significantly through critical reflection on the English teaching practicum. The critical aspect denotes more changes in enacting teaching methods. PSTs also managed effective interactions with students. In this respect, the class was more organized, and students were engaged in learning. This finding is consistent with that of Shah et al. (2020), who pointed out that PC developments have emerged from reflections on managing classrooms. This study confirms that critical reflection on teaching practicum is applied as an alternative and potential strategy to stimulate PC development (Arslan, 2019; Nganga, 2020). However, the class management enactment lies in collective class management depending on students' needs and atmosphere. It deals with adjusting instructions to class size and level, student level, presentation formats, and technology use (Perumal & Maistry, 2021; Supkhonovna, 2021; Tutyandari, 2023). The probable elaboration for this finding is that PSTs' capability in managing classrooms can be developed through engagement in enacting critical reflection to organize classes effectively. Cranton and Taylor (2012) argue that PSTs need to develop learners' engagement in the classroom for more comfortable class management. The process of changing individual, social, and professional adult learners will undergo in the class through knowledge expression, information and engagement, and perceptions and thoughts evaluation (Kaspar, 2018; Qin et al., 2022).

The important finding also lies within significantly developed knowledge of pedagogical approaches. PSTs' teaching methods and scenario planning abilities have significantly developed. They learned from the shortcomings during the teaching practicum. PSTs enacted teaching strategies such as discussion or dialogue. In this respect, the strategies

lead classes to review learning materials and discuss arising issues. This study supports research evidence indicating that pedagogical approach development makes better decisions about when and how to use the strategy, in which classes to use it, and how to adapt it for classes (Madhavaram, 2021; Perumal & Maistry, 2021). An alternative elucidation for this result is that PSTs require critical reflection in developing their knowledge due to the urgent pedagogy knowledge and a decision to apply. The difficulties they faced in their teaching experience led them to critically evaluate and improve their practicum. Developing knowledge of pedagogical approaches such as teaching planning, teaching methods, technology-mediated teaching methods, experiential projects, scenario lesson planning, reflective teaching, and teaching management projects guides PSTs to decide on better enactment in classes (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010; Supkhonovna, 2021).

Another result is that PSTs' PC has significantly developed within student management capability. PSTs have approached students to identify their diverse characteristics more efficiently. In this regard, PSTs can escort students to respond to their instructions actively, closer to the student's condition during class. This result accords with previous research showing student management capability with gradual and effective student management to shape student behavior. The capabilities include assessing students' learning achievement and reactions, motivating, advising, and mentoring students to build a superb relationship with students (Perumal & Maistry, 2021; Shah et al., 2020). The possible enlightenment for this result is that PSTs require enacting approaches by recognizing and identifying students' diverse characteristics to significantly develop their capability in managing students. The efforts build an outstanding relationship with the students to teach effectively. Within the PC taxonomy, ways for PC to enhance student management capability become essential for teachers in teaching practice to apply more effective teaching (Konig et al., 2020).

These findings suggest that, with critical reflection influencing significant PC development, PSTs should consider the practical ways of developing each aspect of PC throughout the teaching practicum within the placement schools. More particularly, they are required to address concerns in the gradual development of their knowledge of the pedagogical approach and their capabilities in classroom and student management. Taking into consideration that the critical reflection on the teaching practicum impacted their PC developments, PSTs are recommended to evaluate their teaching practicum with a focus on the shortcomings of PC developments. The developments fall within their knowledge of the pedagogical approach and capabilities of classroom and student management.

The unexpected finding is the extent to which PSTs' critical reflection on English teaching practicum influences their habits of mind in preferred training and reevaluation on teaching performance for continuous growth for professional development. This finding appeared during their first reflective practice, but PSTs could train their capability to build habits of mind in teaching practice. Critical reflection contributed to the PSTs' change of habits of mind by determining the suitable teaching materials and approaches to achieve learning objectives. This result aligns with a previous study that habits of mind lead PSTs to actions of thinking and strongly feeling things influenced by their perspectives in the field of education (Jacobs & Haberin, 2022). This result confirms Mezirow's (1991) argument that habits of mind are PSTs' frame of reference. In this regard, PSTs should reevaluate their teaching experiences for the training and creation of the habits of mind for successful teaching practices and their future professions.

Another possible explanation for this is that PSTs reevaluated the teaching practicum for better quality through critical reflection. Due to many challenges encountered in the classrooms, they considered establishing emotional and interactive relationships with the students. They found it hard to encourage the students to participate in learning, but they could manage to make the class better gradually. PSTs' perspectives have changed after thinking about the past and present conditions of teaching practices regarding teaching evaluation in their critical reflection on the teaching practicum. Mezirow (1997) states that the innovative pedagogical practices empower PSTs to reflect on their teaching experience for teaching practice reevaluation critically. Pena-Sandoval (2019) also asserts that the practice teaching evaluation leads PSTs to enhance PC. This study further emphasizes the necessity of changing the perspectives for reevaluating teaching practice performance in relation to evaluating PSTs' perceptions and thoughts of their knowledge and engagement in critical reflection during the teaching practicum for better teaching quality. To train and create habits of mind during teaching practices is very urgent in order to support the advancement of PSTs' teaching profession.

The findings are relevant to the theory supporting the present study. Critical reflection as reflection-on-action on teaching practicum (Farrell, 2007) contributes to PSTs' PC aspects development during the teaching practicum. Mezirow (1997) also contends that the pedagogical practices empower PSTs to reflect on their teaching experience for teaching practice reevaluation critically. The pedagogical practices, such as critical reflection practice on the teaching practicum, motivated PSTs to reevaluate the teaching practicum to raise the quality of teaching practices for future teaching professions (Mezirow, 1991, 1997).

5.2 The EFL PSTs' Transformative Learning (TL) Knowledge Attributed by Critical Reflection

The current investigation found that the PSTs' TL knowledge grasped from their critical reflection on the English teaching practicum is on interactive discussion or dialogue, wherein they allow students to discuss freely in exchange for thoughts. In this respect, PSTs' criticality falls within the transformation in critical thinking for better teaching practices (Wyant & Lockwood, 2018). The interactive discussion and dialogue contribute to PSTs' development of criticality and critical thinking since PSTs can consider various perspectives and arguments for their analytical skill improvement, learn to evaluate information and identify weaknesses and develop strong argument as well, improve effective communication skills particularly in conveying clear idea and argument, and develop reflective skills by considering their thinking process and those of their students (Cranton & Taylor, 2012; Mezirow & Taylor, 2009). A possible explanation for this result might be that PSTs require building up interactive discussion, as it is urgent in TL. The superb interaction would engage students in innovative activities to exchange ideas collaboratively and think critically for quality teaching practices. Dialogue leads students to become critical individuals and equips them with lifelong education practice (Carter & Kurttis, 2019). Likewise, collaborative group discussion allows students to share ideas and knowledge, interpreting experiences to shape recent and common understandings (Cranton & Taylor, 2012). This result corroborates the previous work in PSTs' professional capability building in the TL framework (Nolan & Molla, 2021), showing that PSTs' professional capabilities, such as teaching methodology, can be built up through critical reflection. This result resonates with the claim that the experience of PSTs' critical reflection

takes place in interaction with others, as it is very crucial in this situation, even though the TL occurs individually (Cranton & Taylor, 2012; Mezirow & Taylor, 2009). However, the enactment of discussion should refer to the TL theoretical framework as a lens to direct the learning process to become meaningful (Kostara et al., 2022; Taylor, 2009).

An interesting finding also indicated that PSTs establish active communications with students inside and outside the classroom. They experienced TL while establishing authentic and supportive relationships. In this matter, establishing authentic and supportive relationships benefited students with distinct personalities in active and meaningful learning, contributing to fostering PSTs' TL. This result is akin to Cranton and Taylor's (2012) research, indicating that building trusting relationships with students can develop self-confidence for effective learning. PSTs establish genuine, positive, productive, and meaningful relationships with students to fabricate a safe class milieu for students' self-discovery. An alternative description for this finding is that PSTs entail establishing productive relationships with the class. By so doing, PSTs can assist students in overcoming their fears, establish opportunities, and foster their self-discovery during classes, presenting active and meaningful learning. Mezirow and Taylor (2009) argue that establishing authentic and supportive relationships between teachers and students is required to advance in TL.

Another crucial result expressed that PSTs attempted to identify the class issue and practiced resolving it by enacting individual issue experiences, the so-called applying personal experience. They built up active communication with students by sharing ideas for their superb relationships. In this regard, PSTs practiced resolving class issues to transform students' mindsets in learning motivation for better learning. This result is in agreement with that obtained by Cranton and Taylor (2012), who pointed out that developing individual experience becomes a starting point to guide students in evaluating normative assumptions to undergo a meaningful learning process. This result resonates with research showing that developing personal experience provides a meaningful knowledge base and practical experience to foster TL (Gibbons & Farley, 2021). However, to bring out developing individual experience, PSTs enact their past extensive experience to boost TL (Jacobs & Haberlin, 2022). The possible explanation for this result is that PSTs require developing personal experience through the teaching practicum. Strengthening personal experience becomes the groundwork for PSTs to assess normative assumptions in carrying out meaningful learning for personal, meaningful knowledge. Mezirow (1997) argues that students who have personal experiences will tend to get more engaged in teaching in TL through practical knowledge and abilities. Similarly, PSTs extend and reflect on their individual experiences to motivate and comprehend themselves and others (Kostara et al., 2022; Mezirow, 1991).

The findings reported here suggest that PSTs are recommended to seek more opportunities to engage in critical reflection on the teaching practicum for TL by taking the merits of TL knowledge. Likewise, PSTs are required to explore diverse ways in the efforts of engaging in TL practices to cultivate their TL, particularly in interactive discussion or dialogue, establishing authentic and supportive relationships, and enacting personal experience. PSTs' critical reflection on the teaching practicum becomes a reflective practice PSTs should undertake. Mezirow's TL theory states that PSTs as adult learners require elucidating a vital condition of the changed view TL experiences in learning activities during teaching practicum (Mezirow, 1991). Hence, critical reflection as a potential strategy for reflective practices is essential in teaching practicum (Farrell, 2007, 2009) since critical reflection can be convenient

in contributing to experiencing PSTs within TL, and their criticality lies within more changes in critical thinking (Wyant & Lockwood, 2018) for quality teaching practices.

To conclude, critical reflection on ELT practicum becomes a reflective practice that PSTs should practice in the teaching practicum. Critical reflection on teaching practice (Farrell, 2007) is essential in teaching practicum because it contributes to PSTs the aspects of PC and TL during the teaching practicum. The implementation refers to Mezirow's TL theory, which states that, in learning activities, explaining a vital condition of the changed view experienced by PSTs is necessary. A process referring to TL is the process that enables PSTs to re-evaluate their beliefs and past experiences of teaching practice (Mezirow, 1997). Within Madhavaram and Laverie's (2010) PC framework, the study findings fall in the areas of PC development. Owning each element can enhance PSTs' PC to be competent and transformational teachers, particularly to improve the quality of foreign language teaching. Therefore, Mezirow's TL theory and Madhavaram and Laverie's PC framework are both very closely influenced by the framework of critical reflection. In this respect, if PSTs carry out critical reflection practice during the teaching practicum, they have gone through and experienced professional teacher development practices. Hence, PSTs will get well-prepared to face their future career as teachers.

The findings indicate the main issues regarding the aspects of PSTs' PC that showed significant development as a result of critical reflection on the English teaching practicum and the PSTs' TL experiences attributed by critical reflection on the English teaching practicum. Despite the fact that it is not all PSTs can improve their PC and TL in the light of critical reflection, their critical aspects indicate more changes in teacher roles, critical thinking for better teaching, perspectives for teaching upgrades, and enacting teaching methods that could significantly develop PC and TL aspects during the teaching practicum. However, a very careful notice should be taken into account, considering the transferability of the present research. These might be applied to an English teaching practicum in quite similar contexts of ESL/EFL.

6. Conclusion

This phenomenological case study delved into the significant development of pedagogical competence (PC) aspects as a result of critical reflection and the EFL PSTs' transformative learning (TL) knowledge attributed by critical reflection. The key findings revealed knowledge of pedagogical approach and capability to manage classroom and students as significant developments that were gained from the critical reflection throughout the teaching practicum program. Other findings exposed their TL knowledge of interactive discussion or dialogue, establishing authentic and supportive relationships, and applying personal experience that is comprehended within TL practices. The important findings lie within the themes of PC elements (Madhavaram & Laverie, 2010; Shah et al., 2020). PSTs applied to manage the learning process for an effective and conducive learning atmosphere during the teaching practicum. In addition, their TL experience from teaching practicum confirms TL principles (Cranton & Taylor, 2012; Mezirow & Taylor, 2009). PSTs implemented in the learning process for big changes in personal perspective, comprehension, and behavior. However, the unexpected finding appeared in which critical reflection benefits PSTs' habits of mind in preferred training and reevaluation on teaching performance for continuous growth for teacher professional development. This finding, therefore, confirms

Mezirow's (1991) argument that habits of mind are PSTs' frame of reference used in reevaluating teaching experience to successful teaching practices for their future career.

The current study makes a contribution that lies within pedagogical implications. *First*, critical reflection can be enacted throughout teaching practicum programs for reflective practice. As a potential tool of evaluation, critical reflection drives PSTs to boost pedagogical practices for PC development and greatly enhance TL. *Second*, critical reflection during teaching practicum at placement schools with diverse teaching atmospheres can be employed. The teaching experience in certain teaching environments provides PSTs with a new field experience of teaching practicum, impacting their PC development and TL experience. *Third*, seeing the elements of criticality of their critical reflection, PSTs are prompted to engage in critical thinking to reevaluate their teaching practices to advance the quality of teaching practices within the TL framework. Criticality presents PSTs to become critical individuals and equips them with lifelong education practices. *Fourth*, critical reflection benefits PSTs' habits of mind in preferred training and reevaluation of teaching performance. PSTs can practice critical reflection to enhance habits of mind as their frame of reference to reevaluate teaching experience for successful teaching practices. *Finally*, it implies redesigning the curriculum of teaching practicum programs of the English Teacher Education Programs in the EFL/ESL contexts due to the deficiency of reflective practices in the existing curriculum. The aptly redesigned curriculum allows PSTs to fabricate such an innovative way for critical reflection practices to hone PSTs with reflective practice during the teaching practicum. The pertinent redesigned curriculum prompts the enactment of critical reflection, developing PSTs' PC and TL knowledge, and leveraging them for professional development practice towards their successful future teaching careers.

7. Limitations and Future Research

The present study was limited in several areas. Firstly, the study is conducted in the Indonesian EFL context wherein PSTs enacted English teaching practicum in the placement schools. Future research might explore critical reflection on the road to PC and TL alterations from distinct pictures of English teaching practicum, such as international teaching practicum, to attain data from the wider contexts of EFL/ESL. Secondly, the data collection techniques for the present study are carried out through reflective journals and focused group interviews, wherein the collected data are obtained from fewer data sources. Future research might apply other techniques, such as teachers' teaching files and video observation of teaching practicum, to attain complete data from the classroom dynamics; the video observation becomes a potential technique since it benefits to picture real data from the classroom, not just the assumptions from the participants' memory. More multiple data might be acquired to yield a distinct expectancy of the results pertaining to the current study issue. Thirdly, the study problematizes critical reflection towards PC and TL developments involving PST participants in undertaking teaching practicum. Future research might require extra input from another type of teacher participants, in-service teachers, to examine the phenomena with particular and unique impacts of critical reflection on English teaching practices. Lastly, the interview questions for this study were limited in exploring the data of the aspects of PSTs' PC that developed significantly through critical reflection and their TL experience in the light of critical reflection. However, exploration of any challenges or aspects that did not develop as expected

remains unexplored. Future research should explore any difficulties in engaging with critical reflection or in applying TL principles.

8. About the Author

M. Zaini Miftah is a faculty member at Universitas Islam Negeri Palangka Raya, Palangka Raya, Indonesia, and a research fellow at INTI International University, Nilai, Malaysia. He holds a doctoral degree from Universitas Negeri Malang, Malang, Indonesia. His research interests include ELT pedagogy, academic writing, ICT in ELT, reflective teaching, and teacher professional development. He can be reached at m.zaini.miftah@uin-palangkaraya.ac.id.

Utami Widiati is a professor in English Language Teaching (ELT) at Universitas Negeri Malang, Malang, Indonesia, and a research fellow at Universiti Sultan Zainal Abidin, Kuala Terengganu, Malaysia. She has researched and published extensively in the areas of TEFL, curriculum and material development, SLA, and teacher professional development. She can be reached at utami.widiati.fs@um.ac.id.

Anik Nunuk Wulyani is a professor in English Language Teaching (ELT) at Universitas Negeri Malang, Malang, Indonesia. She earned her Ph.D. in Applied Linguistics from Victoria University of Wellington (VUW), New Zealand. Her research interests are in the areas of teacher professional development, ELT, and CALL. She can be reached at anik.nunuk.fs@um.ac.id.

Tengku Intan Suzila Tengku Sharif is a faculty member at Universiti Teknologi MARA, Pahang, Malaysia. She obtained her Ph.D from Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia. Her research areas include technology in education, TESL, and the study of endangered languages. She can be reached at intansuzila@uitm.edu.my.

9. Acknowledgement

We would like to express our sincere gratitude to the anonymous reviewers and the editors for their constructive and insightful comments during the publication process of this manuscript. We are also grateful to the Research and Community Service Unit of Universitas Negeri Malang, Malang, Indonesia, which has funded our research, based on which this article was written.

10. Declaration of AI Use

No AI tools were used in the preparation of the manuscript.

10. References

- Archer-Kuhn, B., Samson, P., Damianakis, T., Barrett, B., Matin, S., & Ahern, C. (2021). Transformative learning in field education: Students bridging the theory/practice gap. *British Journal of Social Work*, 51, 2419–2438. <https://doi.org/10.1093/bjsw/bcaa082>

- Ardi, P., Mukti, T. W. P., Basthomi, Y., & Widiati, U. (2023). Delving into Indonesian EFL pre-service teachers' professional identity configuration in teaching practicum. *rEFlections*, 30(2), 223–246. <https://so05.tci-thaijo.org/index.php/reflections/article/view/266762>
- Arslan, F. Y. (2019). Reflection in pre-service teacher education: Exploring the nature of four EFL pre-service teachers' reflections. *Reflective Practice*, 20(1), 111–124. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2018.1564652>
- Auliya, A. G., Marlina, N., & Dewi, N. S. N. (2020). Reflective practice in international teaching practicum: A case study of an Indonesian pre-service teacher in Thailand. *Journal of Teaching & Learning English in Multicultural Contexts (TLEMC)*, 4(2), 75–86. <http://dx.doi.org/10.37058/tlemc.v4i2.2164>
- Black, A. D. (2021). Starting with the teacher in the mirror: Critical reflections on whiteness from past classroom experiences. *The Clearing House: A Journal of Educational Strategies, Issues and Ideas*, 94(3), 116–127. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00098655.2021.1907142>
- Boyatzis, R. (1998). *Transforming qualitative information: Thematic analysis and code development*. SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Carter, P. W., & Kurtts, S. A. (2019). Dialogic reflective e-journaling: Providing extra field-based support to special education preservice teachers by enhancing their critical reflection skills and transformative learning. *Reflective Practice*, 20(3), 383–395. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2019.1617125>
- Cho, H., & Johnson, P. (2020). Preservice teachers' transformative learning through field experience with emergent bilinguals in a dual language school. *Reflective Practice*, 21(6), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14623943.2020.1821625>
- Cirocki, A., & Widodo, H. P. (2019). Reflective practice in English language teaching in Indonesia: Shared practices from two teacher educators. *Iranian Journal of Language Teaching Research*, 7(3), 15–35. <https://dx.doi.org/10.30466/ijltr.2019.120734>
- Cirocki, A., & Imsa-ard, P. (2024). Integrating reflective practice into undergraduate teacher education programmes in ELT: A no-lose deal for Thai universities. *PASAA*, 68(1), 440–468. <https://doi.org/10.58837/CHULA.PASAA.68.1.13>
- Cranton, P., & Taylor E. W. (2012). Transformative learning. In P. Jarvis & M. Watts (Eds.), *The Routledge international handbook of learning* (pp. 194–203). Routledge.
- DeJonckheere, M., & Vaughn L. M. (2019). Semistructured interviewing in primary care research: A balance of relationship and rigour. *Family Medicine Community Health*, 7(e000057), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1136/fmch-2018-000057>
- Dewey, J. (1933). *How we think: A restatement of the relation of reflective thinking to the educative process*. Heath.
- Dikilitas, K., & Comoglu, I. (2022). Pre-service English teachers' reflective engagement with stories of exploratory action research. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 45(1), 26–42. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2020.1795123>
- Farrell, T. S. C. (2007). *Reflective language teaching: From research to practice*. Continuum.
- Farrell, T. S. C. (2009). Critical reflection in a TESL course: Mapping conceptual change. *ELT Journal*, 63(3), 221–229. <https://doi.org/10.1093/elt/ccn058>
- Farrell, T. S. C. (2019). *Reflective practice in ELT*. Equinox.

- Fereday, J., & Muir-Cochrane, E. (2006). Demonstrating rigor using thematic analysis: A hybrid approach of inductive and deductive coding and theme development. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 5(1), 80–92. <https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690600500107>
- Gibbons, S., & Farley, A. N. (2021). Learning to think like a teacher: Effects of video reflection on preservice teachers' practice and pedagogy. *Action in Teacher Education*, 43(3), 250–267. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.2020.1812131>
- Hammersley, M., & Traianou, A. (2012). *Ethics in qualitative research: Controversies and contexts*. SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Harland, D. J., & Wondra, J. D. (2011). Preservice teachers' reflection on clinical experiences. *Journal of Digital Learning in Teacher Education*, 27(4), 128–133. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21532974.2011.10784669>
- Hendriwanto. (2021). A reflective teaching practicum as a platform for stimulating pre-service teachers' professional development. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 47(4), 624–626. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02607476.2021.1941812>
- Jacobs, J., & Haberlin, S. (2022). Transformative learning within an international teaching experience: Developing as emerging culturally responsive teachers. *Action in Teacher Education*, 44(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.2021.1955774>
- Janesick, V. J. (2015). Peer debriefing. In *The Blackwell Encyclopedia of Sociology* (pp. 2–3). John Wiley & Sons, Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781405165518.wbeosp014.pub2>
- Kabilan, M. K., Ramdani, J. M., Mydin, A., & Junaedi, R. (2020). International teaching practicum: Challenges faced by pre-service EFL teachers in ESL settings. *LEARN Journal: Language Education and Acquisition Research Network Journal*, 13(1), 114–126. <https://so04.tci-thajjo.org/index.php/LEARN/article/view/237833>
- Kaspar, M. O. (2018). Blended learning as a transformative pedagogy for equity. *The English Journal*, 107(6), 54–60. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2307/26610194>
- Konig, J., Bremerich-Vos, A., Buchholtz, C., & Glutsch, N. (2020). General pedagogical knowledge, pedagogical adaptivity in written lesson plans, and instructional practice among preservice teachers. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 52(6), 800–822. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2020.1752804>
- Kostara, E., Gavrielatos, A., & Loads, D. (Eds.). (2022). *Transformative learning theory and praxis: New perspectives and possibilities*. Routledge.
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). Establishing trustworthiness. In *Naturalistic Inquiry* (pp. 289–331). SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Madhavaram, S. (2021). Shelby D. Hunt's contributions to the marketing discipline: Research programs, impact, and compelling opportunities. *Journal of Global Scholars of Marketing Science*, 31(2), 125–129. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21639159.2020.1785921>
- Madhavaram, S., & Laverie, D. A. (2010). Developing pedagogical competence: Issues and implications for marketing education. *Journal of Marketing Education*, 32(2), 197–213. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0273475309360162>
- Merriam, S. B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. Jossey-Bass.
- Mezirow, J. (1991). *Transformative dimensions of adult learning*. Jossey-Bass.

- Mezirow, J. (1997). Transformative learning: Theory to practice. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 74, 5–12. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ace.7401>
- Mezirow, J., & Taylor, E. W. (Eds.), (2009). *Transformative learning in practice: Insights from community, workplace, and higher education*. Jossey-Bass.
- Miftah, M. Z., Basthomi, Y., & Syahid, A. (2022). Preservice teachers' reflections on English teaching practicum for professional development: A bibliometric analysis. *Pedagogika*, 147(3), 198–226. <https://doi.org/10.15823/p.2022.147.10>
- Miftah, M. Z., Widiati, U., & Wulyani, A. N. (2025). Exploring critical reflection on ELT practicum to develop pedagogical competence for Indonesian EFL preservice teachers' transformative learning. *Education and Self Development*, 20(1), 27–41. <https://doi.org/10.26907/esd.20.1.03>
- Miftah, M. Z., Widiati, U., Wulyani, A. N., & Sharif, T. I. S. T. (2024). Preservice teachers' pedagogical competence and transformative learning in a dual online-offline teaching practicum. *Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 43(2), 381–397. <https://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/cp/article/view/54371>
- Nganga, L. (2020). Analyzing children's literature for hidden bias helps preservice teachers gain pedagogical practices in critical multicultural education. *Journal of Research in Childhood Education*, 34(1), 93–107. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02568543.2019.1692109>
- Nolan, A., & Molla, T. (2021). Building teacher professional capabilities through transformative learning. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 49(1), 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1359866X.2020.1828823>
- Pena-Sandoval, C. (2019). Advancing culturally relevant pedagogy in teacher education from a Chilean perspective: A multi-case study of secondary preservice teachers. *Multicultural Education Review*, 11(1), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2005615X.2019.1567093>
- Perumal, K., & Maistry, S., (2021). Pedagogical competencies of South African marketing educators. *Africa Education Review*, 17(5), 56–75. <https://doi.org/10.1080/18146627.2021.1878377>
- Qin, B., Zhu, G., Cheng, C., Membiela, P., Mena, J., & Zhu, J. (2022). Leveraging third space amid Chinese and Spanish student teachers' teaching practicums: A transformative learning perspective. *Professional Development in Education*, 48(1), 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2021.1939101>
- Rachmawati, D. (2022). Self-concept of EFL preservice teachers as reflected in their teaching performance. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 12(1), 40–55. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v12i1.46533>
- Saldana, J. (2021). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Sari, L. K., Thomas, V., Backer, F. D., & Lombaerts, K. (2022). Pre-service teachers' teaching challenges and the transformative learning opportunities during teaching practice in Indonesian remote areas. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 45(5), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2022.2071257>
- Seidman, I. (2006). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences* (3rd ed.). Teachers College Press.
- Senyshyn, R. M. (2018). Teaching for transformation: Converting the intercultural experience of preservice teachers into intercultural learning. *Intercultural Education*, 29(2), 163–184. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2018.1429791>

- Shah, P., Laverie, D. A., & Madhavaram, S. (2020). Summative and formative evaluation of marketing teaching portfolios: A pedagogical competence-based rubric. *Marketing Education Review*, 30(4), 208–224. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10528008.2020.1823235>
- Silverman, D. (2015). *Interpreting qualitative data*. SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Suciu, A. I., & Mata, L. (2011). Pedagogical competences – The key to efficient education. *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 3(2), 411–423.
- Supkhonovna, H. N. (2021). Technology for the development of the qualities of pedagogical competence in future teachers. *Asian Journal of Multidimensional Research*, 10(5), 372–382. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5958/2278-4853.2021.00416.X>
- Taylor, E. W. (2009). Fostering transformative learning. In J. Mezirow, E. W. Taylor & Associates (Eds.). *Transformative learning in practice: Insights from community, workplace and higher education*. Jossey-Bass.
- Tutyandari, C. (2023). Exploring EFL preservice teachers' sense of self-efficacy in teaching: An Indonesian case. *PASAA*, 65(1), 57–78. <https://doi.org/10.58837/CHULA.PASAA.65.1.3>
- Widiati, U., & Hayati, N. (2015). Teacher professional education in Indonesia and ASEAN 2015: Lessons learned from English language teacher education programs. In *ASEAN integration and the role of English language teaching* (pp. 121–148). IDP Education. http://dx.doi.org/10.5746/LEiA/ASEAN_Integ_ELt
- Widodo, H. P. (2014). Methodological considerations in interview data transcription. *International Journal of Innovation in English Language Teaching and Research*, 3(1), 101–107.
- Widodo, H. P., & Ferdiansyah, S. (2018). Engaging student teachers in video-mediated self-reflection in teaching practica. In K. J. Kennedy, & J. C-K. Lee (Eds.), *Routledge International Handbook of Schools and Schooling in Asia* (pp. 922–934). Routledge. <https://www.routledgehandbooks.com/doi/10.4324/9781315694382-89>
- Wong, K. T., Hwang, G. J., Goh, P. S. C., & Arrif, S. K. M. (2020). Effects of blended learning pedagogical practices on students' motivation and autonomy for the teaching of short stories in upper secondary English. *Interactive Learning Environments*, 28(4), 512–525. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2018.1542318>
- Wong, F., Kember, D., Chung, L. Y. F., & Yan, L. (1995). Assessing the level of student reflection from reflective journals. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 22, 48–57. <https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2648.1995.22010048.x>
- Wyant, B. R., & Lockwood, B. (2018). Transformative learning, higher order thinking, and the inside-out prison exchange program. *Journal of Correctional Education*, 69(3), 49–67. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2307/26864112>
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods* (6th ed.). SAGE Publications Ltd.
- Zhu, G., Chen, B., Li, C., & Li, D. (2020). Examining preservice teachers' professional learning experience during the international teaching practicums: Insights from complexity theory and boundary-crossing construct. *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 46(5), 701–704. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02607476.2020.1770580>